Introduction to Public Health Law

New Local Health Officer Orientation
Madison, Wisconsin – November 17, 2016
Brittney Bauerly, J.D., Network for Public Health Law

The Network for Public Health Law

Contact the Network to:
• Get practical legal assistance on a variety of public health topics
• Find helpful resources from webinars and trainings to fact sheets and legal briefs
• Connect with a community of experts and users of public health law

Support is available at no cost! Visit www.networkforphl.org for more information.

Objectives

» Describe role of law in protecting public health
» Explain the sources of the government’s legal authority and responsibilities to protect public health
» Identify constitutional principles that limit government power
» Apply legal thinking to emerging public health challenges
» Describe common legal pitfalls
» Identify strategies for learning laws and statutes and public health law resources
» Identify situations when legal advice or assistance may be required
What Is Public Health Law?

The study of the legal powers and duties of the state, in collaboration with its partners (e.g., health care, business, the community, the media, and academe), to ensure the conditions for people to be healthy (to identify, prevent, and ameliorate risks to health in the population), and of the limitations on the power of the state to constrain for the common good the autonomy, privacy, liberty, proprietary, or other legally protected interests of individuals.


Two Key Concepts

Authority

Limitations

Jacobson v. Massachusetts
U.S. Supreme Court, 197 U.S. 11 (1905)

- Landmark Court Case
- Setting: 1902 Smallpox Outbreak (MA)
- Law: State statute authorizing compulsory vaccination
- Violation: Jacobson refused to comply with vaccination order and was fined ($5); challenged the constitutionality of the law
- Ruling: U.S. Supreme Court upheld the law

“Upon the principle of self-defense, of paramount necessity, a community has the right to protect itself against an epidemic of disease which threatens the safety of its members.”
**Jacobson v. Massachusetts**

Key Holdings and Implications

- Beginning of application of modern constitutional analysis to disease control law
- Key holdings for states:
  - Use of police powers to protect public health
  - Delegation of authority to health agencies and other government subdivisions
  - Effective public health interventions may limit individual liberty
- Provides constitutional support for spectrum of contemporary public health laws

**Levels of Government**

- Federal
- Tribal
- State
- Local

**Sources of Law**

- Constitution
- Statutes
- Regulations
- Ordinances
- Court Opinions (Case Law)
- International Agreements and Treaties
- Contracts, Memorandums of Understanding or Agreement
Principles in the U.S. Constitution

» Federalism
» Separation of Powers
» Limiting the Government’s Power

Federalism

» The powers of the national government are enumerated and limited.
» Powers that are not granted to the federal government by the Constitution, and that are not prohibited to the states, are reserved to the states and to the people (10th Amendment).
» These residual powers (“police powers”) authorize states to regulate matters affecting the health, safety, and general welfare of the public and its citizens.

Separation of Powers

» The Constitution creates branches of government, so that absolute power does not reside in any one branch of government.
» Legislative
» Executive
  • U.S. Department of Health and Human Services
  • Wisconsin Department of Health Services
» Judicial
Limits on Government Power

» First Amendment
   Freedom of speech, religion, and right to peacefully assemble

» Second Amendment
   Right to bear arms

» Fourth Amendment
   Prohibits unreasonable searches and seizures

» Fifth Amendment
   Due process of law; just compensation for condemnations

» Fourteenth Amendment
   Equal protection and due process of law

Federal Public Health Power

» Enumerated Powers in the Constitution
   • Power to regulate interstate commerce, tax, set conditions on federal spending

» Implied Powers

» Supremacy Clause

For an overview on public health legal powers, see James G. Hodge, Jr., Public Health Law in a Nutshell (2014).

State Public Health Power

» Sovereign powers via the 10th Amendment

» Police powers
   • Police power refers to the power to regulate health, safety, and welfare for the common good.

» Parens patriae powers
   • “Parent of the country”: allows state to act in interests of community and individuals’ own best interests.
Local Public Health Power

» County, city or other local public health officials are on the front line of public health practice
» Authority to act comes from delegations of state police power via state constitutional, legislative, or executive means ("home rule" authority)

Tribal Public Health Power

» Public health powers flow from federal government.
» As sovereigns, tribal governments have public health powers similar to states.
» Indian Health Service

Preemption

» Preemption occurs when a "higher" level of government eliminates or limits the authority of a "lower" level of government to regulate a certain issue.
» Local government may be barred from acting if the state or federal government has "occupied the field."
» May be express or implicit
**Tools of Public Health Law**

- Power to tax and spend
- Power to alter the informational environment
- Power to alter the built environment
- Power to alter the socioeconomic environment
- Direct regulation
- Indirect regulation through the tort system
- Deregulation: laws as a barrier to public health


---

**Hot Topic: Obesity Prevention**

**Authority:**

**Limitations:**

---

**Hot Topic: Zika Emergency Preparedness**

**Authority:**

**Limitations:**
Hot Topic: Vaccinations

Anticipating and Recognizing Legal Issues

» Is there a reasonable chance that the public's health is or may be threatened?
» Is your ability and authority to address the situation unclear?
» Is there a possibility that the event or circumstance could expose the health department to liability, media attention or political pressure?
» Would the cost of a court case outweigh the cost of consulting an attorney?

Common Legal Pitfalls

» Failing to build a relationship with your attorney and to seek legal input early
» Failing to have a proactive legal agenda and only reacting to crises, or only continuing the status quo
» Failing to get community input and/or provide due process when developing new legal approaches
Strategies for Learning Law and Statutes

» Start with what is the department working on—how does law affect that aspect of public health?
» Governance structure - roles of different public health officials
» Get active in the Public Affairs/Advocacy committees of professional groups such as WPHA and WALHDAB or topical advocacy groups
» Contact NACCHO for opportunities (public health law workgroup)
» Explore Network resources:
  » Join the Network to get regular legal updates; bimonthly newsletter
  » Free monthly webinars on public health law topics; technical legal assistance
  » See Wisconsin Public Health Authorities Fact Sheet
» Attend the National Public Health Law Conference

The Network for Public Health Law:
Public Health Legal Support — National Scope with Local Expertise

» Five Regional Offices provide local and state support

Five Regions
National Coordinating Center/Northern Region
» Public Health Law Center at Mitchell Hamline School of Law
Eastern Region
» The University of Maryland School of Law working with the John Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health
Mid-States Region
» University of Michigan School of Public Health
Southeastern Region
» University of North Carolina Gillings School of Global Public Health working with the National Health Law Program
Western Region
» Sandra Day O’Connor College of Law at Arizona State University
Northern Region

» Serves 8 states

Areas of national expertise:
» Rural public health
» Mental health and wellness

Sample Technical Assistance Requests

• Video Directly Observed Therapy: What laws and regulations are implicated by the use of VDOT for tuberculosis?
• Flu Vaccination: What are some legal challenges relating to mandatory vaccination of health care workers?
• Privacy Issues for Minors and Young Adults: How can we address the tension between health information privacy for dependents and explanations of benefits provided by health insurers?

Access Helpful Resources

» Network products, such as fact sheets, tables of state laws, legal briefs and more
» Monthly webinar series
» Public health lawyer directory
» Library of legal assistance questions and answers
» External resources
» Network newsletters
» Events

www.networkforphl.org
Contact Info

Brittney Bauerly
Network for Public Health Law
St. Paul, MN
651-695-7620
bauerly@networkforphl.org

Questions?

Thank you for your attention!